

# #-Rewriting Systems

## and An Infinite Hierarchy Resulting from Them

**Alexander Meduna**



[meduna@fit.vutbr.cz](mailto:meduna@fit.vutbr.cz)

Brno University of Technology, Czech Republic

**Based upon**

**Křivka, Z., Meduna, A., Schönecker, R.:**

Generation of Languages by Rewriting Systems that Resemble  
Automata,

In: *IJFCS* Vol. 17, No. 5, 2006

# Contents

- 1. Concepts**
- 2. Definition**
- 3. Main Result: An Infinite Hierarchy**
- 4. Open Problem Areas**

# #-Rewriting Systems in Formal Language Theory

- Language-defining models
- Pure rewriting systems
- Between automata and grammars:  
have states but generate languages

# Concept

*#-Rewriting System* is based on the rules of the form

$$p_m \# \rightarrow q \ x_0 \# x_1 \dots \# x_n$$

by which the system makes a computational step  $\Rightarrow$  as

$$\begin{array}{c}
 m\text{th } \# \\
 \downarrow \\
 (p, \dots \# y_{m-1} \# y_m \# y_{m+1} \dots) \Rightarrow \\
 (q, \dots \# y_{m-1} \# x_0 \# x_1 \dots \# x_n \# y_m \# y_{m+1} \dots)
 \end{array}$$

## Definition 1/2

**#-Rewriting System (#RS)** is a quadruple

$$H = (Q, \Sigma, s, R), \text{ where}$$

- $Q$ —finite set of *states*,
- $\Sigma$ —*alphabet*,  $\# \in \Sigma$  is called a *bounder*,
- $s \in Q$ —*start state*,
- $R$ —*finite set of rules* of the form

$$p_m \# \rightarrow qx$$

where  $p, q \in Q$ ,  $m$  is a positive integer,  $x \in \Sigma^*$ .

## Definition 2/2

*Configuration:*  $(q, x)$ ,  $q \in Q$ ,  $x \in \Sigma^*$

*Computational step:*

$(p, u\#v) \Rightarrow (q, u\#xv)$  [ $p_m\# \rightarrow qx \in R$ ],  
 where the number of  $\#$ s in  $u$  is  $m - 1$ ,  
 $p, q \in Q$ ,  $u, x, v \in \Sigma^*$ .

*Generated language:*

$L(H) = \{w \in (\Sigma - \#)^* : (s, \#) \Rightarrow^* (q, w) \text{ in } H, q \in Q\}$ .

# Example: #RS

**#RS H:**

***H* generates *aabbcc*:**

[1].  $s_1 \# \rightarrow p \##$

[2].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow q a\#b$

[3].  $q_2 \# \rightarrow p \#c$

[4].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow f ab$

[5].  $f_1 \# \rightarrow f c$

# Example: #RS

**#RS  $H$ :**

[1].  $s_1 \# \rightarrow p \#\#$

[2].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow q a \# b$

[3].  $q_2 \# \rightarrow p \# c$

[4].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow f a b$

[5].  $f_1 \# \rightarrow f c$

**$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

$(s, \#)$

$\Rightarrow$



# Example: #RS

#RS  $H$ :

[1].  $s_1 \# \rightarrow p \##$

[2].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow q a \# b$

[3].  $q_2 \# \rightarrow p \# c$

[4].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow f ab$

[5].  $f_1 \# \rightarrow f c$

$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :

$(s, \underline{\#})$

$\Rightarrow$

[1]

# Example: #RS

**#RS  $H$ :**

[1].  $s_1 \# \rightarrow p \#\#$

[2].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow q a \# b$

[3].  $q_2 \# \rightarrow p \# c$

[4].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow f a b$

[5].  $f_1 \# \rightarrow f c$

**$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

$(s, \#)$   
 $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$  [1]  
 $\Rightarrow$

# Example: #RS

**#RS  $H$ :**

[1].  $s_1\# \rightarrow p\#\#$

[2].  $p_1\# \rightarrow q\#a\#b$

[3].  $q_2\# \rightarrow p\#c$

[4].  $p_1\# \rightarrow f\#ab$

[5].  $f_1\# \rightarrow f\#c$

**$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

$(s, \#)$   
 $\Rightarrow (p, \underline{\#}\#)$  [1]  
 $\Rightarrow$  [2]

# Example: #RS

**#RS  $H$ :**

[1].  $s_1\# \rightarrow p\#\#$

[2].  $p_1\# \rightarrow q\ a\#b$

[3].  $q_2\# \rightarrow p\ \#c$

[4].  $p_1\# \rightarrow f\ ab$

[5].  $f_1\# \rightarrow f\ c$

**$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

$(s, \#)$

$\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$  [1]

$\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$  [2]

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: #RS

#RS  $H$ :

[1].  $s_1\# \rightarrow p\#\#$

[2].  $p_1\# \rightarrow q\ a\#b$

[3].  $q_2\# \rightarrow p\ \#c$

[4].  $p_1\# \rightarrow f\ ab$

[5].  $f_1\# \rightarrow f\ c$

$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :

$(s, \#)$   
 $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$  [1]  
 $\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$  [2]  
 $\Rightarrow$  [3]

# Example: #RS

**#RS  $H$ :**

[1].  $s_1\# \rightarrow p\#\#$

[2].  $p_1\# \rightarrow q\#a\#b$

[3].  $q_2\# \rightarrow p\#\#c$

[4].  $p_1\# \rightarrow f\#a\#b$

[5].  $f_1\# \rightarrow f\#c$

**$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

$(s, \#)$

$\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$  [1]

$\Rightarrow (q, \#a\#b\#)$  [2]

$\Rightarrow (p, \#a\#b\#\#c)$  [3]

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: #RS

**#RS H:**

[1].  $s_1\# \rightarrow p\#\#$

[2].  $p_1\# \rightarrow q\ a\#b$

[3].  $q_2\# \rightarrow p\ \#c$

[4].  $p_1\# \rightarrow f\ ab$

[5].  $f_1\# \rightarrow f\ c$

**H generates  $aabbcc$ :**

$(s, \#)$

$\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$  [1]

$\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$  [2]

$\Rightarrow (p, a\underline{\#}b\#c)$  [3]

$\Rightarrow$  [4]

# Example: #RS

**#RS  $H$ :**

[1].  $s_1 \# \rightarrow p \##$

[2].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow q a \# b$

[3].  $q_2 \# \rightarrow p \# c$

[4].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow f ab$

[5].  $f_1 \# \rightarrow f c$

**$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

$(s, \#)$

$\Rightarrow (p, \##)$  [1]

$\Rightarrow (q, a \# b \#)$  [2]

$\Rightarrow (p, a \# b \# c)$  [3]

$\Rightarrow (f, aabb \# c)$  [4]

$\Rightarrow$



# Example: #RS

#RS  $H$ :

[1].  $s_1\# \rightarrow p\#\#$

[2].  $p_1\# \rightarrow q\ a\#b$

[3].  $q_2\# \rightarrow p\ \#c$

[4].  $p_1\# \rightarrow f\ ab$

[5].  $f_1\# \rightarrow f\ c$

$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :

$(s, \#)$

$\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$  [1]

$\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$  [2]

$\Rightarrow (p, a\#b\#c)$  [3]

$\Rightarrow (f, aabb\#c)$  [4]

$\Rightarrow$  [5]

# Example: #RS

#RS  $H$ :

[1].  $s_1\# \rightarrow p\#\#$

[2].  $p_1\# \rightarrow q\ a\#b$

[3].  $q_2\# \rightarrow p\ \#c$

[4].  $p_1\# \rightarrow f\ ab$

[5].  $f_1\# \rightarrow f\ c$

$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :

$(s, \#)$

$\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$  [1]

$\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$  [2]

$\Rightarrow (p, a\#b\#c)$  [3]

$\Rightarrow (f, aabb\#c)$  [4]

$\Rightarrow (f, aabbcc)$  [5]

# Example: #RS

#RS  $H$ :

[1].  $s_1 \# \rightarrow p \#\#$

[2].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow q a \# b$

[3].  $q_2 \# \rightarrow p \# c$

[4].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow f a b$

[5].  $f_1 \# \rightarrow f c$

$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :

$(s, \#)$

$\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$  [1]

$\Rightarrow (q, a \# b \#)$  [2]

$\Rightarrow (p, a \# b \# c)$  [3]

$\Rightarrow (f, a a b b \# c)$  [4]

$\Rightarrow (f, a a b b c c)$  [5]

$$L(H) = \{a^n b^n c^n : n \geq 1\}$$

# Finite index of #RS

#-Rewriting systems of *index*  $k$ :

$\Rightarrow$  over configurations with  $k$  or fewer #s  
 $\#RS_k$  – the language family generated by  
 $\#RS$ s of index  $k$

**Example:** Index  $k = 2$ :

$$1. (p, a\#a\#b) \Rightarrow (q, aa\#aa\#b) [p_1\# \rightarrow qa\#a \in R]$$

**OK**

$$2. (p, a\#a\#b) \not\Rightarrow (q, a\#aa\#\#bb) [p_2\# \rightarrow qa\#\#\#b \in R]$$

**INCORRECT**

# Example: #RS of finite index

#RS  $H$ :

[1].  $s_1 \# \rightarrow p \##$

[2].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow q a \# b$

[3].  $q_2 \# \rightarrow p \# c$

[4].  $p_1 \# \rightarrow f ab$

[5].  $f_1 \# \rightarrow f c$

$H$  generates  $aabbcc$ :

$(s, \#)$   
 $\Rightarrow (p, \##)$  [1]  
 $\Rightarrow (q, a \# b \#)$  [2]  
 $\Rightarrow (p, a \# b \# c)$  [3]  
 $\Rightarrow (f, aabb \# c)$  [4]  
 $\Rightarrow (f, aabbcc)$  [5]

$H$  is of index 2.

$L(H) = \{a^n b^n c^n : n \geq 1\} \in \#RS_2$

# Main Result: An Infinite Hierarchy

**Theorem:  $\#RS_k \subset \#RS_{k+1}$ , for all  $k \geq 1$ .**

---

## Proof:

makes use of programmed grammars ( $PG$ ) of index  $k$

# Proof: Programmed Grammars

*Programmed Grammar (PG)* is a modification of context-free grammar based on the rules of the form:

$$r: A \rightarrow x, W_r$$

- $r: A \rightarrow x$  is a context-free rule labeled by  $r$ ,
- $W_r$ —finite set of rule labels

*Derivation step* ( $\Rightarrow$ ):

after the application of rule  $r$ ,  
a rule from  $W_r$  has to be applied

## Proof: Finite index of $PG$

Programmed grammars of *index*  $k$ :

- $\Rightarrow$  over sentential forms with  $k$  or fewer occurrences of nonterminals.

$P_k$  – the language family defined by  
programmed grammars of index  $k$



# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow$   $ABC$ ,  $\{2, 5\}$

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow$   $aA$ ,  $\{3\}$

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow$   $bB$ ,  $\{4\}$

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow$   $cC$ ,  $\{2, 5\}$

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow$   $a$ ,  $\{6\}$

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow$   $b$ ,  $\{7\}$

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow$   $c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2:  $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3:  $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4:  $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5:  $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6:  $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7:  $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

$S$

$\Rightarrow$

[1]

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow ABC$  [1]

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$  [2]

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$  [3]

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$



# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$  [4]

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c, \emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBcC$**  [4]

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBcC$**  [4]

$\Rightarrow$  [5]

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBcC$**  [4]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabBcC$**  [5]

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBcC$**  [4]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabBcC$**  [5]

$\Rightarrow$  [6]

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBcC$**  [4]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabBcC$**  [5]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabbccC$**  [6]

$\Rightarrow$

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c, \emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBcC$**  [4]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabBcC$**  [5]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabbccC$**  [6]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabbcc$**  [7]

# Example: $PG$

**$PG$   $G$ :**

1:  **$S$**   $\rightarrow ABC$ , {2, 5}

2:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow aA$ , {3}

3:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow bB$ , {4}

4:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow cC$ , {2, 5}

5:  **$A$**   $\rightarrow a$ , {6}

6:  **$B$**   $\rightarrow b$ , {7}

7:  **$C$**   $\rightarrow c$ ,  $\emptyset$

**$G$  generates  $aabbcc$ :**

**$S$**

$\Rightarrow$   **$ABC$**  [1]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aABC$**  [2]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBC$**  [3]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aAbBcC$**  [4]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabBcC$**  [5]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabbccC$**  [6]

$\Rightarrow$   **$aabbcc$**  [7]

$$L(G) = \{a^n b^n c^n : n \geq 1\} \in P_3$$



Proof:  $P_k = \#RS_k, k \geq 1$

$P_k \subseteq \#RS_k:$

Let  $G$  be a  $PG$  of index  $k$ . Construct a  $\#RS$   $H$  of index  $k$ , so  $H$  simulates derivation step

$a\underline{A}bBc \Rightarrow_G adXYbBc [p: A \rightarrow dXY, \{q, o\}] \Rightarrow_G \dots [q]$

as

$(\langle \underline{A}B, p \rangle, a\underline{\#}b\#c) \Rightarrow_H (\langle XYB, q \rangle, ad\#\#b\#c)$   
 $[\langle \underline{A}B, p \rangle_1 \# \rightarrow \langle XYB, q \rangle d\#\#]$

Proof:  $\#RS_k = P_k, k \geq 1$

$\#RS_k \subseteq P_k$ :

Let  $H$  be a  $\#RS$  of index  $k$ . Construct a  $PG$   $G$  of index  $k$ , so  $G$  simulates a computational step

$$(p, a\underline{\#}b\#c) \Rightarrow_H (q, aa\#b\#b\#c) [p_1\# \rightarrow q a\#b\#]$$

as

$$\begin{aligned}
 & a\underline{\langle p, 1, 2 \rangle} b\underline{\langle p, 2, 2 \rangle} c \\
 1) \text{ Renumbering: } & \Rightarrow_G a\underline{\langle q'', 1, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle p, 2, 2 \rangle} c \\
 & \Rightarrow_G a\underline{\langle q'', 1, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q', 3, 3 \rangle} c \\
 2) \text{ Rewriting: } & \Rightarrow_G aa\underline{\langle q', 1, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q', 2, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q', 3, 3 \rangle} c \\
 3) \text{ Finalization: } & \Rightarrow_G aa\underline{\langle q, 1, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q', 2, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q', 3, 3 \rangle} c \\
 & \Rightarrow_G aa\underline{\langle q, 1, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q, 2, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q', 3, 3 \rangle} c \\
 & \Rightarrow_G aa\underline{\langle q, 1, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q, 2, 3 \rangle} b\underline{\langle q, 3, 3 \rangle} c
 \end{aligned}$$

**Proof:  $\#RS_k \subset \#RS_{k+1}$ ,  $k \geq 1$**

**Recall that:**

- $P_k \subset P_{k+1}$ , for all  $k \geq 1$
- 

**As  $P_k = \#RS_k$ , for all  $k \geq 1$ , we have**

**Theorem:  $\#RS_k \subset \#RS_{k+1}$ , for all  $k \geq 1$ .**

---

# Future Investigation

- Determinism
- Unlimited index
- Other variants:
  - Right-linear
  - Context-sensitive
  - Parallel

## Discussion